Commission on Safety Standards
Twelfth Meeting
18-19 November 2002
IAEA Headquarters, Vienna
Report of the Meeting

1. Opening

Mr. Taniguchi, Deputy Director General, Head of the Department of Nuclear Safety, opened the twelfth meeting of the Commission on Safety Standards and extended his warm welcome to all participants. Mr. Taniguchi introduced two new members of the Commission; Mr. A. Oliveira from Argentina, who replaces Mr. E. D'Amato and Mr. Y.S. Eun from Korea, who replaces Mr. S.J. Kim

2. Adoption of Agenda and Report of the Eleventh Meeting

The agenda for the twelfth meeting of the Commission was approved with amendments[1]. The approved agenda is attached as Annex I. The draft report of the eleventh meeting was approved with the following amendments:

- Page 6, Item 7.4, line 1; delete "6th", insert "7th";
- Page 6, Item 8.1, 1st para; replace the third sentence by: "The technical officer presented a document listing the major changes made to the regulations and informed the Commission that these major changes had been reviewed by TRANSSC for their significance. As a result of this review TRANSSC recommended that the 2003 edition be published as an amendment to the previous full edition (the 1996 Edition) rather than as a new edition, which would require approval of the Board of Governors."
- Page 6, Item 8.1, 4th para; replace the last sentence by: "Any modifications can only be published in 2005 ready for potentially entering into force in 2007."
- Page 7, insert as a new 2nd para: "The Chairman of TRANSSC offered to seek TRANSSC's endorsement of the proposed changes, but the Commission did not consider this to be necessary."

The list of actions arising from the deliberations at the twelfth meeting is attached as Annex II.

3. Overview of the Activities in the Department of Nuclear Safety

3.1. Department of Nuclear Safety

Mr. Taniguchi presented an overview of recent events and current issues related to the activities of the NS Department and informed the Commission of the following:

- A resolution on measures for strengthening international co-operation in nuclear, radiation, transport and waste safety was adopted at the General Conference;
- The General Conference approved the IAEA budget and programme for 2003, the approved budget represents zero real growth for the Department of Nuclear Safety and the Agency as a whole;
- A decision by the Director General to merge all IAEA activities relating to security. The current proposal is to integrate these activities into one organizational unit within the

[1] Item 7.1 of the draft Agenda 'Safety Guide DS17' was withdrawn. RASSC will review the guide before it is resubmitted to the Commission for review. The subsequent items under Agenda Item 7 were renumbered accordingly.

Department of Nuclear Safety, effective from 1 January 2003. This may involve renaming the department to Department of Safety and Security.

- The programme and Budget for 2004 and 2005 is in the stages of consultation with the Member States. An increase of 11% for the Agency's budget has been proposed; the proposed increase for the budget of the Nuclear Safety Department is around 8%;
- The work on a new Agency medium term strategy will start soon. The contribution of Nuclear Safety Department will include the results of the Commission's deliberations on the strategy for safety standards and the vision and strategy for strengthening the global safety regime as well an integrated approach for safety standards and their application.
- A meeting with representatives of the EC was held during the General Conference to discuss the issue of having regional nuclear safety standards as well as IAEA nuclear safety standards. Subsequently two further discussions took place, one at the expert level was held in Vienna in October and one with Mr Williams representing the CSS and Mr Versteeg for the IAEA with the EC on 13 October in Brussels.
- A meeting of Steering Committee of OECD/NEA held in October included a special session on 'Safety standards for NPPs in an international context'. The participants expressed strong support for the IAEA Safety Standards that cover nuclear power plants.

Mr. Taniguchi also informed the Commission that the feedback from the participants at the senior regulators' meeting had been very positive and supportive of the draft strategy for the safety standards. They considered that meeting had been very informative and appreciated the opportunity to be involved, at an early stage, in the discussion of policy issues. The fact that the draft strategy paper was made available to the senior regulators in advance of the meeting was highly appreciated. Efforts should be made to use the same model for future meetings of senior regulators, by making the meeting a thoroughly two way dialogue. Mr. Taniguchi indicated suggestions for topics for future meetings of senior regulators are welcome.

3.2 Division of Nuclear Installation Safety

Ms. Carnino, Director of NSNI, reported on the resolution of General Conference relating to Nuclear Safety. The resolution addresses topics of education and training, safety services, the Nuclear Safety Convention, and the Code of Conduct on the safety of research reactors.

3.3 Division of Radiation and Waste Safety

Mr. Gonzalez, Director of NSRW, reported on activities relating to radiation, transport and radioactive waste safety, including information on:

- The Preparatory meeting of contracting parties of the Joint Convention;
- The reports from the United Nations Scientific Committee on the Effects of Atomic Radiation;
- The ongoing discussion of new ICRP recommendations, stating that no change is expected before 2004;
- Policy issues relating to residues of past accidents and activities;
- The Conference on Decommissioning, possibly leading to a code of conduct;
- The Code of Conduct on the Safety and Security of Radiation Sources;
- The revision of the TECDOC on categorization of sources
- Development of standards for radiation sources covering all stages from manufacturing to disposal.

The Commission questioned the use of documents other than safety standards to support Codes of Conduct (for instance, a TECDOC on categorization of radiation sources is used to

support the Code of Conduct on the Safety and Security of Radiation Source). It was pointed out that Codes of Conduct are not safety standards but are intended to be used by Member States to reinforce their commitment to the relevant safety measures. They are therefore not subject to the same review process as the safety standards. It was decided to bring this to the attention of the Director General.

4. Policy Issues

4.1 Results of the IAEA Programme Evaluation: Safety Standards Related Activities

Mr. Versteeg reported on the main findings of the programme evaluation on the safety standards related activities and the results of the related questionnaire. The Commission requested that full copy of the report to be made available. [Annex II, 12.1].

4.2 Strategy Report: Universal Standards for the 21st Century

The Chairman presented the report and the note prepared for submission to the Director General. The two reports had also been submitted to the members of the four Committees for their comments and views[2].

The Commission discussed the reports and decided on a set of documents to be prepared in connection with the strategy on safety standards. The following is the set of documents to be prepared and the course of action in relation[3] to each of the documents.

The Note to the Director General: the Chairman will revise the document on the basis of the comments made. The revised version will be submitted to the members of the Commission for their views soon after the conclusion of the present meeting. The Chairman will prepare a final version of the note for submission to the Director General with a covering letter outlining the activities of the Commission in relation to the strategy, along with a recommendation to bring the Note to the attention of the Board of Governors in March 2003. [Annex II, 12.2].

Overview (philosophical) document: setting out the aims, vision, structure, process, review cycle and other aspects of the safety standards to be prepared with the intention of reaching a wide audience. A draft of the document will be prepared by the Secretariat in consultation with the Chairman. The draft will be distributed to the members of the Commission and the Committees in early March, requesting their comments and views by mid-April 2003. A revised version will be prepared on the basis of the comments received in time for consideration by the Commission in June. A final version of the overview document will be prepared by early July for submission to the September session of the Board of Governors and the General Conference. [Annex II, 12.3].

Overall Structure of the Safety Standards: the Committees are requested to take a 'top-down' approach (safety requirements and supporting safety guides) for the development of an overall structure for their topical areas, including those that should fall under General Safety. Proposals made at the senior regulators' meeting (strategy report Attachments I and II) should be considered for the development of the overall strategy. The work of the Committees should be completed by mid-April 2003. The Secretariat will consider the work of the Committees as an input for preparing a unified report for consideration by Commission in June 2003. A final version of the overall structure will be prepared by early July for submission to the September

[2] The Commission had before it written comments from Messrs Czoch, de Munk, Sajaroff, Suda, Webster, and Wilson.

[3] The timetable for preparation of some of the documents was agreed on with the Chairman after the meeting.

session of the Board of Governors and the General Conference. [Annex II, 12.4].

Action Plan: An action plan for further development of the safety standards in accordance with the overall structure for strengthening co-ordination within the Secretariat and among the Committees, and for promoting the use of safety standards (both by the Agency and the Member States) will be prepared by the Secretariat in time for consideration by the Commission in June. A final version of the action plan will be prepared by early July for submission to the September session of the Board of Governors and the General Conference. [Annex II, 12.5]

4.3 Safety Fundamentals

The Commission decided to take the lead for the development of a common safety fundamentals. A sub-group of the Commission composed of Messrs Holm, Oliveira, Pereira and Williams will meet in April to draft the fundamentals for consideration by the Commission in June. [Annex II, 12.6]. After approval by the Commission, the draft will be circulated to the Committees before it is submitted to Member States for comments.

5. Status of Safety Standards and Actions from the Commission's Meetings

The Scientific Secretary informed the Commission of the status of the safety standards endorsed by the Commission and the progress made since the last meeting. The progress has been good and the aim of publishing the standards within six months of their endorsement is now becoming a reality.

The Scientific Secretary reported on the response to the actions arising from the eleventh meeting of the Commission. The following is the list of actions and how they have been addressed:

- Action 11.1 The Commission decided to design a strategy for further development of the safety standards and their global acceptance. The draft strategy will be discussed at the senior regulators' meeting, reviewed at the Commission's November meeting and submitted for approval to the March 2003 Session of the Board of Governors. *A draft strategy paper was prepared and presented at the senior regulators' meeting. A revised version was presented at the November meeting of the Commission.*
- Action 11.2 The Secretariat was asked to write to all Member States extending the Member State consultation period for draft safety guide DS161 to September 2002. The Commission also questioned the use of the term 'scope defining level' and asked the Secretariat to note the Commission's concern regarding this new term in the letter to Member States and to seek comments on the content of the safety report as well as the safety guide. *A letter was sent to the Member States seeking comments on the safety report, expressing the Commission's views regarding the term 'scope defining level' and extending the deadline for comments.*
- Action 11.3 The Commission asked the Secretariat to circulate the questionnaire to the members of the Commission for comment prior to its submission to Member States. *The questionnaire was circulated to the members of the Commission and their views considered prior to its distribution to the Member States.*
- Action 11.4 The Commission requested the Secretariat working with the Chairman of TRANSSC perform a review, by consulting the real users of the regulations, on the practicality of the 2-year review cycle. If it is considered impractical, then the modal organizations should be approached for a solution. *A report on the topic, prepared by a consultant, with comments from the users (international modal organization, state*

competent authorities and an international organization representing consignors and carriers) was presented to the Commission. The Commission pointed out that the report prepared by the consultant is primarily based on response from regulatory bodies. The fact that there is only one response from a consignor and one International organization, the report cannot be considered a representative survey. The Commission is still not convinced of the appropriateness of the two-year review cycle, TRANSSC is requested to inform the Commission of any further development on the topic.

- Action 11.5 The Commission requested that the Secretariat working with the Chairman of TRANSSC try to simplify the designation of the regulations, which are based on historical developments, to either the year of their publications or the year that they come into force. In addition, further consideration should be given to increasing the frequency of TRANSSC meetings in order that more effort may be devoted to making the regulations more user friendly. *The Commission was informed that the designation for the publication anticipated in 2003; of the amendments to the existing transport regulations would be 'TS-R-1, As Amended 2003'. The possibility of increasing the frequency of TRANSSC meetings, to more than one per year will be considered again at TRANSSC VIII in February 2003.*
- Action 11.6 The Secretariat was asked to review the guide, in consultation with member from France, focusing on the guide's important attributes and if necessary transferring some of the background material to annexes. The revised guide should be sent to the Chairman of RASSC and ILO for agreement. The agreed text should then be submitted to the Commission for endorsement. *The safety guide has been revised in accordance with the comments made at the last meeting. However, the Chairman of RASSC decided that it would be appropriate to send the revised version to RASSC for review before resubmitting it to Commission for final endorsement in June 2003.*

6. Activities of the Committees on Safety Standards

The Commission was informed that the meetings of RASSC and WASSC have been rescheduled from October to December 2002. NUSSC held its 14th meeting in October 2002.

Mr. Reiman informed the Commission of the work of NUSSC and of the deliberations at the 14th meeting. Members of NUSSC have requested that the Secretariat provide them with feedback on the resolution of comments in advance of the NUSSC meeting. Mr. Bevington reported on the progress of the standards since the last meeting of the Commission.

The Commission requested that the Secretariat develop an appropriate mechanism for informing the members of how their comments have been taken into account, to use a standard format for the cover page of the draft safety standards (date and draft No. On the top left hand corner) and consider posting the DPPs on the website. [Annex II, 12.7].

7. Safety Standards

7.1 Flood Hazard for NPPs on Coastal and River Sites (DS280), Safety Guide

Mr. Contri, Technical Officer for the development of the safety guide, presented the guide and outlined its development. The guide has been subject to review by NUSSC. The Commission endorsed the publication of the safety guide.

7.2 External Events (excluding earthquakes) in NPP Design (DS301), Safety Guide

Mr. Contri, Technical Officer for the development of the safety guide, presented the guide and outlined its development. The guide has been subject to review by NUSSC. The Commission endorsed the publication of the safety guide, with the following changes to page 105, Annex III:

- Before the list insert: "which also provide some conditions for their applicability";
- After the list insert: "These values are intended to provide a preliminary evaluation of the risk associated to impairment of operator actions in case of release of toxic gases. A more accurate evaluation should consider the specific nature of the chemical agent and more refined hypotheses for the simulation of their dispersion at the site."

7.3 Seismic Design and Qualification for NPPs, (DS304), Safety Guide

Mr. Contri, Technical Officer for the development of the safety guide, presented the guide and outlined its development. The guide has been subject to review by NUSSC. The Commission endorsed the publication of the safety guide.

8. Document Preparation Profiles

8.1 Quality Assurance for the Safety of Radioactive Waste Management Facilities and Activities (DS331)

Mr. Metcalf, Technical Officer, presented the DPP for the preparation of the Safety Guide. The Commission decided to hold back the approval of the DPP pending the development of the overall structure for the safety standards and the quality assurance area in particular. It was also pointed out that the scope of the guide as outlined in the DPP is too wide and duplicates many aspects of the current safety requirement and guides in the area of quality assurance. The Commission recommended the preparation of a DPP on quality assurance related to waste products and packaging of radioactive waste.

9. Presentation and Discussion of Regulatory Issues

The members of the Commission presented the recent regulatory issues of significance in their countries.

10. Chairman's Meeting with the Director General

After the meeting of the Commission, the Chairman met with Mr. I. Biggs of the Director General's Office. Mr. Williams reported on the Commission's meeting, including the broad agreement reached on the nature of the safety standards, the concept of 'best practices', the revision process and on the communication strategy and global acceptability of the Safety Standards.

Mr. Williams will write to the Director General, in early January 2003, to inform him on the progress made regarding the strategy for safety standards; with a recommendation to bring the report to the attention of the Board of Governors during the March 2003 Session. In this connection the Commission will prepare a package on Safety Standards that could in principle be ready for discussion and approval by the September Board and the General Conference. It will consist of three elements:

- An overview brochure. The Commission will produce the material for an overview brochure explaining the philosophy of the safety standards in a user friendly manner;
- A paper describing the structure and scope of the safety standards;
- An action plan for the further development and promotion of the safety standards.

In addition, a Commission's subgroup will work on the consolidation of the three existing Safety Fundamentals on nuclear installation, radiation protection and waste management into one document. The document will follow the normal process of consultation with the Committees and the Member States.

Mr. Williams raised the Commission's concern that codes of conduct are being used to introduce new safety standards that are not subject to review by the Commission, resulting in a two-tier standards process by the Agency. It was noted that codes of conduct should clearly reference and be based on the safety standards and provide a mechanism for reinforcing national commitments to the standards. Currently Codes of Conduct are developed and agreed by open-ended groups of technical and legal experts and submitted to the Board of Governors for approval. The process does not formally involve the safety standards Committees or the Commission.

Mr. Williams also reported on the meeting with the Cabinet of Ms. De Palacio regarding the development of European safety standards, which reflects the European Commission's view that it should acquire competence in nuclear safety matters in connection with the accession of new member states with nuclear facilities.

Mr. Williams also raised the issue of the revision of the set of quality assurance standards. The Department of Nuclear Energy is planning a consultants meeting to review the quality assurance standards for nuclear facilities. This meeting is being arranged in close collaboration between the staff of the departments of Nuclear Safety and Nuclear Energy. It is hoped that this would provide the basis for the review by the Committees and the Commission in order for them to integrate the number of standards on this topic that are currently being developed in isolation. The Commission will consider this plan at its next meeting and advise on the comprehensiveness and any specific actions required to make quality assurance fit into the overall structure of safety standards.

Mr. Biggs, who had been in contact with the Director General prior to the meeting, raised the following topics:

- The successful completion of the TranSAS mission to the United Kingdom.
- In view of the Commission's concern regarding an overlap with a proposed Standing Advisory Group on the Nuclear and Radiation Safety Programme, it was indicated the Commission would like to see the draft mandate of the group.
- On the topic of reallocation of responsibilities for security, Mr. Biggs noted that the new administrative arrangements for security should not be misunderstood as reflecting any diminution of the priority attached to specific Agency programmes. Mr. Williams agreed and underlined that it is helpful to consider safety and security side by side in order to find the right balance.
- On the issue of publication and printing of safety standards Mr. Biggs enquired whether the Commission is now satisfied with the situation. Mr. Williams pointed out to the large improvement made over the last year and expressed the Commission's satisfaction.

13. Dates and Agenda for the next Meeting

The schedule of the meetings of the Commission and the Committees for 2003 is as follows:

Commission	2-4 June and 17-19 November.
NUSSC	7-9 April and 20-22 October.
RASSC	24-28 March and 6-10 October
WASSC	24-28 March and 6-10 October.
TRANSSC	17-21 February.

The tentative lists of standards to be reviewed at the next meeting include DS17, DS67, DS282, DS303, DS283, and DS300.

ANNEX I

AGENDA
Twelfth Meeting of the
COMMISSION ON SAFETY STANDARDS
18-20 November 2002
Meeting Room CO7-IV, IAEA Headquarters, Vienna

1. Opening of the Meeting (14:00)
   T. Taniguchi, DDG-NS

2. Introduction, Adoption of the Agenda and Summary Record of the Eleventh Meeting
   L.G. Williams

3. Overview of the Activities in the Department of Nuclear Safety
   - 3.1 Department of Nuclear Safety; *T. Taniguchi, DDG-NS*
   - 3.2 Division of Nuclear Installation Safety; *A. Carnino, DIR-NSNI*
   - 3.3 Division of Radiation and Waste Safety; *A. J. Gonzalez, DIR-NSRW*

4. Policy Issues
   - 4.1 Results of the IAEA Programme Evaluation: Safety Standards Related Activities
     J. Versteeg
   - 4.2 Strategy Report: Universal Standards for the 21st Century
     L.G. Williams

5. Status of the IAEA Safety Standards and the Actions Arising from the CSS Meetings
   A. Karbassioun

6. Report of Nuclear Safety Standards Committee
   L. Reiman, Chairman/L. Bevington, Scientific Secretary - NUSSC

7. Safety Standards
   - 7.1 Flood Hazard for NPPs on Coastal and River Sites (DS280), Safety Guide
     P. Contri, Technical Officer
   - 7.2 External Events (excluding earthquakes) in NPP Design (DS301), Safety Guide
     P. Contri, Technical Officer
   - 7.3 Seismic Design and Qualification for NPPs, (DS304), Safety Guide
     P. Contri, Technical Officer

8. Document Preparation Profiles
   - 8.1 Quality Assurance for the Safety of Radioactive Waste Management Facilities and Activities (DS331), Safety Guide*; P. Metcalf, Technical Officer*

9. Presentation and Discussion of Regulatory Issues
   (CSS Members)

10. Any other business

11. Report of the Meeting and Recommendations, Date of the Next Meeting

ANNEX II
ACTIONS ARISING FROM THE TWELFTH MEETINGS OF THE COMMISSION

12.1 The Commission requested that full copy of the report to be made available. *(Ref. Item 4.1)* **[Action: Secretariat]**

12.2 The Chairman will prepare a final version of the note for submission to the Director General with a covering letter outlining the activities of the Commission in relation to the strategy, along with a recommendation to bring the Note to the attention of the Board of Governors in March 2003. *(Ref. Item 4.2)* **[Action: Chairman and Secretariat]**

12.3 A final version of the overview document will be prepared by early July for submission to the September session of the Board of Governors and the General Conference. *(Ref. Item 4.2)* **[Action: Chairman and Secretariat]**

12.4 A final version of the overall structure will be prepared by early July for submission to the September session of the Board of Governors and the General Conference. *(Ref. Item 4.2)* **[Action: Chairman and Secretariat]**

12.5 A final version of the action plan will be prepared by early July for submission to the September session of the Board of Governors and the General Conference. *(Ref. Item 4.2)* **[Action: Chairman and Secretariat]**

12.6 The Commission decided to take the lead for the development of a common safety fundamentals. A sub-group of the Commission composed of Messrs Holm, Oliveira, Pereira and Williams will meet in April to draft the fundamentals for consideration by the Commission in June. *(Ref. Item 4.3)* **[Action: Chairman and Secretariat]**

12.7 The Commission requested that the Secretariat develop an appropriate mechanism for informing the members of how their comments have been taken into account, to use a standard format for the cover page of the draft safety standards (date and draft No. On the top left hand corner) and consider posting the DPPs on the website. *(Ref. Item 6)* **[Action: Secretariat]**

PARTICIPATION

The Commission

A. Oliveira, Argentina
A. Caubit da Silva, Brazil
J.K. Pereira, Canada
C. Zhao, China (unable to attend)
A-C. Lacoste, and J. Gauvain, France
G. Feige, Germany (*W. Renneberg*, sent apologies - unable to attend)
S. Sukhatme, India (sent apologies – unable to attend)
N. Suda, S. Nakamura, S. Akimoto, M. Maeoka, and T. Nagano, Japan
Y-S. Eun, Korea, Republic of
I. Kaliberda, Russian Federation (*Y. Vishnevskiy*, sent apologies - unable to attend)
G.A. Azuara, and L. Santoma, Spain
L-E. Holm, Sweden
H. Pfeiffer, Switzerland (*U. Schmocker* sent apologies – unable to attend)
Y. Polurez, Ukraine (*V. Gryschenko* sent apologies – unable to attend)
L.G. Williams, (Chair), R.P. Pape and P. Dikenson, United Kingdom
W.D. Travers, United States of America
R.H. Clarke, ICRP (sent apologies - unable to attend)
K. Shimoura, OECD Nuclear Energy Agency

Note: Members of the Commission are indicated in *italic*

Chairmen of Committees

L. Reiman, NUSSC
G.C. Mason, RASSC (sent apologies – unable to attend)
C.N. Young, TRANSSC
L. Baekelandt, WASSC

IAEA Staff Members

T. Taniguchi, Deputy Director General, Department of Nuclear Safety
A. Carnino, Director, Division of Nuclear Installation Safety (NSNI)
A. Gonzalez, Director, Division of Radiation & Waste Safety (NSRW)
J. Versteeg, Head, Safety Co-ordination Section
L. Bevington, Safety Assessment Section (NSNI)
K. Hioki, Waste Safety Section (NSRW)
R. Pope, Radiation Safety Section (NSRW)
P. Contri, Engineering Safety Section (NSNI)
P. Metcalf, Waste Safety Section (NSRW)
A. Karbassioun, Scientific Secretary, Safety Co-ordination Section